



## SUMMARY REPORT

# 4<sup>th</sup> Regional Workshop on Sustainable Transport Indicators

29 November 2017

Manila, Philippines





## The project context

The TCC Project ‘Energy Efficiency and Climate Change Mitigation in the Land Transport Sector in the ASEAN region’ (Transport and Climate Change (TCC) [www.TransportandClimateChange.org](http://www.TransportandClimateChange.org)) aims to develop strategies and action plans for more sustainable transport.

The project is funded by the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development and implemented by GIZ in cooperation with the ASEAN secretariat.

TCC’s regional activities are in the area of fuel efficiency, green freight and logistics, as well as data, indicators, and MRV. At the national level the project supports relevant transport and environment government bodies in Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, Thailand, and Vietnam for the development of national action plans on sustainable transport. TCC also offers capacity building through different training courses.

**Author:** Julia Nagel

**Editor:** Tali Trigg

**Contact:** ASEAN – German Technical Cooperation Transport and Climate Change  
c/o Office of Transport and Traffic Policy and Planning  
35 Petchaburi Road  
Thung Phaya Thai  
Ratchathewi  
Bangkok 10400 Thailand  
[www.transportandclimatechange.org](http://www.transportandclimatechange.org)

**Project Director:** Tali Trigg



## Table of Contents

Table of Contents.....	3
Abbreviations.....	4
<b>1 Background.....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>2 Summary of Meeting.....</b>	<b>5</b>
2.1 Welcome and Opening Remarks (Mr. Tali Trigg, Atty. Leah Merida Quiambao) .....	5
2.2 Workshop Proceedings .....	6
2.2.1 ‘Setting the scene – objectives of the workshop and re-cap of the previous process (Julia Nagel).....	6
2.2.2 ‘Host country spotlight – Indicators and Data Collection in the Philippines’ (Ms. Diane Fajardo).....	6
2.2.3 ‘First draft of the regional guidelines’ (Mr. Alvin Mejia) .....	7
2.2.4 ‘Building up a regional data collection system in ASEAN (Alvin Mejia) .....	<b>Fehler!</b>
<b>Textmarke nicht definiert.</b>	
2.2.5 Sneak Preview: Training on data, indicators and MRV (Mr. Paponphanai Nanthachatchavankul).....	8
<b>3 Closing and next steps.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>4 Annexes.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Annex 1: Workshop Agenda .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Annex 2: List of Participants.....</b>	<b>11</b>



## Abbreviations

AMS	ASEAN Member States
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BMZ	<i>Deutsches Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung</i> (German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development)
DOTr	Department of Transportation, Philippines
EGSLT	Expert Group on Sustainable Land Transport
GHG	Greenhouse Gas Emissions
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH (German International Cooperation Agency)
KLTP	Kuala Lumpur Transport Strategic Plan
MRV	Measurement, Reporting, Verification
TCC	Transport and Climate Change Project



## 1 Background

With the second largest vehicle fleet in Asia just after China, member countries of the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) already face serious problems including congestion, fossil fuel consumption linked with CO<sub>2</sub> emissions, air pollution, and road safety. In many ASEAN countries, the available information on the environmental impact of transport policies is insufficient and potentially misleading, as the necessary data for indicators is missing. Further, the majority of ASEAN countries are still in the process of defining sustainability goals within the transport sector, and hence would benefit from regional guidance for improving indicator and data availability.

The Kuala Lumpur Transport Strategy Plan 2016-2025 (KLTSP) has reinforced the need for indicators on energy and GHG emissions in the transport sector by adding the Sustainable Transport Goal 2.3. “Develop monitoring framework and harmonised approach for indicators on energy and GHG emissions in the transport sector” which includes the development of a guideline document and action plan on the collection of indicators.

The 4<sup>th</sup> regional workshop on Sustainable Transport Indicators continued to bring together stakeholders from the ASEAN Member States (AMS) working at the intersection of transport, energy, and environmental disciplines to build knowhow for measuring and monitoring transport sector performance.

The main objectives were to:

- Gather experts’ feedback on the first draft regional guidelines on energy efficiency and greenhouse gas emissions in the transport sector in order to help fit the guidelines to the needs of AMS.
- Review approaches for a harmonised and coordinated collection of the indicators on energy efficiency and greenhouse gas emissions in the transport sector in order to identify a suitable approach for regional data collection to be included in the action plan.
- In addition, a GIZ training concept on “Data, Indicator and Measurement, Reporting and Verification (MRV)” will be presented to the audience for feedback.

## 2 Summary of Meeting

### 2.1 Welcome and Opening Remarks (Mr. Tali Trigg, Atty. Leah Merida Quiambao)

Mr. Tali Trigg (GIZ), Project Director for the ASEAN-German technical cooperation project on Transport and Climate Change (TCC), welcomed participants and thanked the Department of Transportation (DOTr) of the Philippines for its support in hosting this workshop. He provided a short summary of TCC and its work on data and indicators in the land transport sector. Reflecting on some of the indicators-related activities in the region, Mr. Trigg observed the importance of developing continuous and long-term data collection and monitoring regimes across ministries and agencies. Shifting to the logistics of the day’s workshop, Mr. Trigg introduced Ms. Julia Nagel and Mr. Alvin Mejia the workshop’s facilitators before handing over to DOTr for welcoming remarks.

Ms. Atty. Leah Merida Quiambao, DOTr Philippines then welcomed the representatives from ASEAN member countries, experts and academia to the 4<sup>th</sup> Sustainable Transport Indicator Workshop and thanked GIZ for being an active partner of the ASEAN promoting and advancing environmentally sustainable policies and programmes in the region. In the light of



growing vehicle fleets in Asia and insufficient information on the environmental impact of transport policies due to missing data, she emphasised the benefits of a regional guidance document to improve indicator and data availability in the ASEAN countries. Building up on previous workshops, she urged everyone's continued support and the need for joint action. She ended her welcoming remarks by wishing everyone a productive and engaging workshop which would contribute to the advancement of a more environmentally sustainable ASEAN region.

## **2.2 Workshop Proceedings**

### **2.2.1 'Setting the scene – objectives of the workshop and re-cap of the previous process (Julia Nagel)**

Ms. Nagel began by reintroducing GIZ and the TCC project to the workshop participants. She highlighted GIZ's work around the world and across a wide range of topics, among which transport and climate change is a significant component. TCC works with the ASEAN Secretariat; it has been active since 2012 and will continue until the end of 2018, and is funded by the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ). TCC has implementation partners in five AMS (Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, Thailand, and Vietnam), but also aims to provide a broader benefit through regional activities, including this process on sustainable transport indicators.

TCC supports implementation of the KLTSP, particularly by aiding partner countries in aligning national policies with regional guidance. KLTSP's chapter on sustainable transport includes specific goals and actions on developing a 'monitoring framework and harmonised approach for indicators on energy and GHG emissions in the transport sector' (KLSTP ST-2.3) through development of specific indicators and guidelines, and compiling data on transport indicators (ST-2.3.2 and ST-2.3.3). This workshop and the larger process of developing sustainable transport indicators for the ASEAN region are critical in putting those goals and actions into practice.

To do that, there have been consultation workshops (first in Jakarta, then Kuala Lumpur, followed by Bangkok, and now in Manila); meetings of the ASEAN Expert Group on Sustainable Land Transport (EGSLT), including later in the week on 30 November-1 December; and discussion of suggested indicators and guidelines, leading up to the formulation of ASEAN Guidelines on Sustainable Transport Indicators. A first draft was prepared and will be discussed at the EGSLT meeting, and finalisation is expected by August 2018.

Ms. Nagel reminded participants of the objectives of the workshop, namely to gather experts' feedback on the first draft regional guidelines on energy efficiency and greenhouse gas emissions in the transport sector, review approaches for a harmonised and coordinated collection of data, as well as to get feedback on a training concept which will be developed by GIZ. She made clear that the results of the workshop would be presented to the EGSLT later in the week.

### **2.2.2 'Host country spotlight – Indicators and Data Collection in the Philippines' (Ms. Diane Fajardo)**

Ms. Fajardo from the DOTr Philippines presented the bigger picture of the Philippine transport sector and its contribution to national CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. She began by presenting the



'ugly truth' in the public transport in the country with 1) inadequate public transportation and facilities; 2) inadequate pedestrian facilities; and 3) unreliable travel times, discomfort, and stress. At present, the government of the Philippines has exerted efforts with the PUV modernisation programme improving higher modes of public transportation, rationalising of roads, and consolidating jeeps and other fleet. She also explained the country's efforts on the promotion of the transport system, shift to cleaner fuels, greening of logistics, aviation, and maritime facilities, and the challenges pertaining to the lack of focal unit for data collection. By looking at the workshop's objectives, she highlighted the importance of sound and reliable data to improve transport systems: "We cannot plan properly if we don't have data and the right monitoring system".

### **2.2.3 'First draft of the regional guidelines and building up a regional data collection system in ASEAN' (Mr. Alvin Mejia)**

Mr. Alvin Mejia, transport expert and consultant to GIZ, led the participants through the late morning and early afternoon by presenting and introducing the first draft of the regional guidelines on energy efficiency and greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in the ASEAN region. The document consists of two elements: A background section and detailed explanations of the indicators in the so-called factsheets. A recommended action plan will be developed as a separated document.

The background section provides the background and the indication on how to use the guidelines. The focus is primarily in road transportation. It also recognises the importance of other pillars of sustainable transport: economic and social indicators. Other data initiatives as well as linkages to important international agreements like the Paris Agreement and the Sustainable Development Goals are also included to highlight the benefits of harmonised data collection.

The second part focuses on the 33 indicators which are included in the guidelines and the selection process. The indicators cover greenhouse gas emissions and energy efficiency on aggregated as well as disaggregated levels. Economic and social factors, known as normalising factors, are also included in the list. Factsheets are developed for each of the indicators with the following structure: 1) the description which provides common definitions and descriptions of the indicator; 2) the objective and relevance which discusses the policy importance of the indicator, and what it aims to provide information on; 3) the unit of measurement which are common and recommended units of reporting for the indicator; 4) the methodology for collecting the data needed for the derivation of the indicator and the applicable associated equations; 5) the potential data sources and 6) the related indicators which refer to the whole set of indicators included in the guidelines which are inputs/dependent indicators of the specific indicator that is discussed.

The second part of the session focused on the action plan and a possible operationalisation of the guidelines. The participants had the opportunity to give their inputs through a group discussion on a possible data collection mechanism for the ASEAN region. One of the key findings that all participants agreed on was the importance of having one lead agency in the respective countries which coordinates the data collection. Other important aspects included the need for verification as well as capacity building given the different status in each of the ASEAN Member states.



The ideas gathered were taken forward to the Expert Group Meeting on Sustainable Land Transport which took place on 30 November 2017. A recommended action plan will be developed with recommendations on how to operationalise the guidelines in the near and long-term future.

#### **2.2.4 Sneak Preview: Training on Data, Indicators and MRV (Mr. Paponphanai Nanthachatchavankul)**

The afternoon session started with group activities to raise participant's awareness on transport data and indicators, Mr. Paponphanai gave an overview of how important of indicators and MRV to the policy and planning for the transport sector are. He emphasised data and indicators are fundamental to monitor the success and sustainability of the policy implementation as well as designing the right policy for the transport sector of each country. He explained that GIZ aims to improve the data basis of the sustainable transport policies by developing a regional training course on "Data, Indicators and MRV for the transport sector". To ensure the practical use of this course, a training needs analysis (TNA) was conducted. The results helped to shape the structure of the course, which will be divided into three modules: 1) Introduction to transport and climate change, 2) Basic transport data and GHG emissions, and 3) Advance monitoring of the transport policy. The target groups of the training course are transport policy makers and relevant technical officers in AMS. GIZ aims at cooperating with training institutions in the region to ensure the sustainability of the training course beyond the project's end in 2018.

The session included a number of interactive elements to strengthen the understanding of how to use the indicators and also explained how to calculate personal vehicle-kilometres travelled to emphasise that data generation and collection is not as complicated as it is often perceived. Participants provided feedback on the different modules of the training, for example on potential barriers of successful training implementation, which will help to finalise it within 2018.

### **3 Closing and Next Steps**

The inputs and results from the discussions serve, once again, as valuable input to the development of the regional guidelines and will ensure the usability of the product. With that, it also contributes to the implementation of the KLTSP and its chapter on sustainable transport. The workshop was the last regional workshop on sustainable transport indicators which directly contributes to the development of the regional guidelines on GHG emissions and energy efficiency in the transport sector in the ASEAN region. The finalisation of the guidelines is foreseen for August 2018; while the publication is expected in October 2018. The final product will be made available on the ASEAN website.



#### **4 Annexes**

- Annex 1 Workshop Agenda
- Annex 2 List of Participants
- Annex 3 [‘Introduction and re-cap of previous discussions’](#) (Ms. Julia Nagel)
- Annex 4 [‘Host country spotlight’](#) (Ms. Diane Fajardo)
- Annex 5 ‘Introduction: Sustainable Transport Indicators on Energy Efficiency and GHG Emissions’ (Mr. Alvin Mejia) - (Presentation is available by [request](#))
- Annex 6 [‘Regional Training Course Development’](#) (Mr. Paponphanai Nanthachatchavankul)



## Annex 1: Workshop Agenda

### Agenda: 4th Regional Workshop on Sustainable Transport Indicators

Wednesday, 29 November 2017

Time	Activity	Responsible/Speaker
08:45	<b>Registration</b>	
09:00	<b>Welcome remarks and opening of the workshop</b>	Atty. Leah Merida- Quiambao DOTr Philippines
09:15	<b>Setting the scene and objectives of the workshop</b> Explanation of context and background including short re-cap of previous discussion results	Julia Nagel, GIZ
09:45	<b>Host country spotlight</b> Indicators and data collection in the Philippines	Ms. Diane Fajardo, DOTr Philippines
10:15	<b>First draft of the regional guidelines I</b> Presentation	Alvin Mejia, GIZ Consultant
10:45	<i>Coffee &amp; tea</i>	
11:15	<b>First draft of the regional guidelines II</b> Presentation including Q&A session	Alvin Mejia
12:15	<i>Lunch</i>	
13:15	<b>Building a regional data collection system in ASEAN</b> Interactive session	Alvin Mejia, Julia Nagel
14:30	<i>Coffee &amp; tea</i>	
15:00	<b>Sneak Preview: Training on data, indicators and MRV</b> Presentation of a comprehensive training under development by GIZ	Papondhanai Nanthachatchavankul; GIZ
16:45	<b>Summary of the workshop results and next steps</b>	Alvin Mejia, Julia Nagel
17:00	<b>Closing</b>	Tali Trigg
18:00	<b>Dinner</b>	-



## Annex 2: List of Participants

No.	Title	Name	Affiliation
1	Mr.	Edwin Arief	ASEAN Secretariat
2	Mr.	Stefan Bakker	Regional
3	Ms.	Chhim Bopta	Brunei Darussalam
4	Ms.	Edna Clemente	Philippines
5	Ms.	Lareina Chua	Philippines
6	Mr.	Renato David	Philippines
7	Ms.	Raquel de Leon	Philippines
8	Ms.	Hannah Fatima Ebro	GIZ
9	Ms.	Diane Fajardo	Philippines
10	Dr.	Horizon Gitano	Regional
11	Mr.	Sudhir Gota	Regional
12	Mr.	Guillermo Francisco II	Philippines
13	Ms.	Sri Winahyu	Indonesia
14	Mr.	Tien Huu Nguyen	Vietnam
15	Mr.	Nopporn Jaroongkiat	Thailand
16	Mr.	Aditya Mahalana	GIZ
17	Ms.	Caroline Lourdes Mangalili	Philippines
18	Mr.	Alvin Mejia	Regional
19	Ms.	Julia Nagel	GIZ
20	Mr.	Papondhanai Nanthachatchavankul	Regional
21	Ms.	Hien Nguyen Thi Phuong	Vietnam
22	Ms.	Julie Pujol	Philippines
23	Ms.	Xaysomnuk Souvannavong	Lao P:D.R
24	Mr.	Alan Sumandar	Indonesia
25	Mr.	Mark Tacderas	Regional
26	Mr.	Eu Jin Toh	Singapore
27	Ms.	Kriztia Torayno	GIZ
28	Mr.	Tali Trigg	GIZ
29	Mr.	Severinus Tukah	Malaysia
30	Dr.	Karl Vergel	Philippines
31	Ms.	Desi Waluyanti	Indonesia
32	Ms.	Sri Wardhani	ASEAN Secretariat
33	Mr.	Chun Kit Henry Wong	Singapore
34	Mr.	Doroteo Jose Yjares	Philippines
35	Mr.	San Yu	Myanmar
36	Ms.	Khairiani Zainuddin Latif	Indonesia
37	Ms.	Patricia Mariano	GIZ
38	Ms.	Ernawath Sadikun	Indonesia